14

(Catukka) Samaņa Sutta

The (Fours) Discourse on the Recluse | \mathbf{A} **4.239** = A:B 4.241 Theme: The lion-roar on the 4 kinds of noble saints Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2016

Significance of the Sutta

The (Catukka) Samana Sutta is significant in at least the following ways:

- (1) It defines the 4 kinds of noble individuals [2].
- (2) The Buddha declares that awakening is only found in the Buddha Dharma, nowhere else [3].
- (3) According to early Buddhism, awakening is gradual [4].

1 The 4 kinds of noble individuals

1.0 The stages of spiritual awakening, according to the historical Buddha, occurs in 4 basic stages, traditionally called streamwinning, once-returning, non-returning and arhathood, thus:

the state		the person	the person			
(1) streamwinning	sotāpatti	streamwinner	sotāpannā			
(2) once-returning	sakadāgāmita	once-returner	sakadāgāmī			
(3) non-returning	anāgāmita	non-returner	anāgāmī			
(4) arhathood	arahatta	arhat	arahata			

Technically, the 4 kinds of noble individuals are defined as follows:

- **1.1** The "<u>first recluse</u>" (*paṭhama samaṇa*) is the **streamwinner**, is one who has destroyed the "3 fetters" (*ti saṃyojana*) [§2]. He is so called because he has boarded or "gone down" (*okkanti*)¹ into the boat which then follows the "current or stream" (*sota*)² that flows upstream (*paṭisota,gāmī*)³ to nirvana, that is, the "ancient city."
- **1.2** The "second recluse" (*dutiya samaṇa*) [§3] is the **once-returner**, one who has destroyed the "3 fetters" [§3.2] and diminished or weakened lust, hate and delusion (*akusal,mūla*, the 3 unwholesome roots of action). ⁵ As such, he will only take one more human birth, at the end of which he attains arhathood and nirvana.
- **1.3** The "third recluse" (tatiya samana) is the **non-returner**, one who has destroyed the 5 lower fetters [§4]. After death, he is "spontaneously reborn" in one of the pure abodes (suddh'āvāsa), and, without ever being reborn in this world, attains final nirvana right there.
- **1.4** The "<u>fourth recluse</u>" (*catuttha samaṇa*) [§5] is the **arhat**, one who has destroyed all his mental influxes, attaining the influx-free freedom of mind, freedom by wisdom through the self-realization of direct knowledge.⁶

2 The differences amongst the 4 individuals

2.0 The differences amongst the 4 kinds of noble individuals are best understood in terms of the 10 mental fetters (*dasa samyojana*), are traditionally listed as follows:

64

¹ See Okkanta Samyutta (S 25) and its 10 suttas, such as (Anicca) Cakku S (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

² On *sota* as meaning "stream" or "ear," see SD 3.2 (3).

 $^{^3}$ V 1:5*= 6* = D 2:36*= 38*= M 1:168* = 2:93*= S 1:136; **Anusota S** (A 4.5/2:5 f) def, SD 78.15; Pug 8, 62; opp *anusota*, "following the stream," A 2:5,12, 6,10*, 214 f; Sn 319; Pug 62,14. Cf *anusota*, patisota, "up and down the stream," M 3:185,30.

⁴ This is an applied metaphor: see **Nagara S** (S 12.65,19-33), SD 14.2.

⁵ On the 3 unwholesome roots (akusala, mūla), see **Mūla S** (A 3.69) SD 18.2; also SD 4.14 (1.5).

⁶ The 4 kinds of recluses are mentioned at D 2:151; M 1:63; Vism 141, 268; Pug:B 88; Vbh 244; VbhA 323; DhsA tr 1:219, 2:451; SnA 161.

(1)	self-identity view	<u>sakkāya,ditthi</u>	7	The 3 fetters: streamwinner
(2)	spiritual doubt	<u>vicikicchā</u>		+3 roots ⁷ weakened: once-returner
(3)	attachment to rituals and vows	<u>sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa</u>	>	
(4)	sensual lust	kāma,rāga		The 5 lower fetters: non-returner
(5)	repulsion	paṭigha ⁸	ノ	
(6)	greed for form existence	rūpa,rāga	7	
(7)	greed for formless existence	arūpa,rāga		
(8)	conceit	māna	>	The 5 higher fetters: arhat
(9)	restlessness	uddhacca		
(10)	ignorance	avijjā	J	

Table 2 The 10 fetters and sainthood

- **2.1 The streamwinner** has destroyed the first 3 fetters: self-identity view, spiritual doubt, and attachment to rituals and vows. Psychologically, these 3 fetters are <u>cognitive</u> in nature: they severely impair how we think. As streamwinners, in other words, we have completely given up what cognitive psychologists would call "maladaptive cognitions" or "negative core beliefs." In simple terms, this is our habitually negative way of *thinking*.⁹
- **2.2 The once-returner** has—like the streamwinner—destroyed the first 3 fetters, and further diminished the effects of the 3 unwholesome roots (greed, hate and delusion). The once-returner has further strengthened his right view so that he is less troubled by greed or hate, that is, he has less sensual desire, which, conversely, means that he also has less ill will.¹⁰
- **2.3 The non-returner** has destroyed all the 5 lower fetters—self-identity view, spiritual doubt, attachment to rituals and vows, sensual lust and repulsion—especially the last two, which are refined forms of greed and hate, or, more specifically, sensual lust. The non-returner is a lay or monastic practitioner who has properly mastered dhyana so that he enjoys mental and meditative bliss, which frees him from seeing the physical body in terms of being attractive or unattractive.¹¹
- **2.4 The arhat** has broken all the 10 fetters, that is, the 5 lower fetters—like the non-returner [2.3]—and the 5 higher fetters, too: greed for form existence, greed for formless existence, conceit, restlessness and ignorance. He is a master dhyana (but may not attain the formless dhyana) so that sensual lust does not trouble him in any way. He has also overcome the view or desire for more refined levels of being or divinity.

Finally, he has overcome what we may call the psychological fetter, the emotional fetter and the existential fetter, which, respectively, refers to conceit, restlessness and ignorance, that is, the last 3 of the 10 fetters. Conceit is the psychological fetter in the sense that, when unawakened, we tend to perceive others as projections of our own lack and pride: we measure others as to how we can profit from associating with them. Overcoming *conceit*, he accepts others as they are with immeasurable lovingkindness.

<u>Restlessness</u> as an emotional fetter gets us "emotionally involved" with the world: we tend to worry about the happiness, safety and progress of others, when we are unable to help them. The arhat's understanding of karma, conditionality and the aggregates allows him to see the world, without any *restlessness*, but with true equanimity.

⁷ "3 roots" = the 3 unwholesome roots (*akusala mūla*): greed, hate and delusion.

⁸ In some places, *patigha* is replaced by ill will (*vyāpāda*).

⁹ It is more difficult to correctly deal with how we <u>feel</u>, which happens with the "express package" leading to non-return and arhathood, when the subtler fetters (esp the last 5) are all destroyed: see [5.4] below on the arhat. On the streamwinner, see [5.1] & SD 40a.8.

¹⁰ On the streamwinner and the once-returner, see SD 40a.8 (2.3.2). On the once-returner, see SD 10.16 (12).

¹¹ On the non-returner, see SD 10.16 (13).

Above all, he has conquered the existential fetter that is <u>ignorance</u>. This is a proper understanding of the meaning and purpose of life, and fulfilling that purpose, that is, attaining spiritual liberation. He has fully understood the nature of the 4 noble truths.¹²

3 Awakening is found only in the Buddha Dharma

3.1 TEACHING TO SUBHADDA

3.1.1 The Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta (D 16) records how, during the Buddha's last days, the wanderer Subhadda, expresses his wish to meet the reclining Buddha, but is turned down by Ānanda, who does not want the Buddha to be disturbed. Hearing their conversation, the Buddha invites Subhadda to approach.

Subhadda then asks the Buddha whether any of the 6 heretical teachers have gained superknowledge. The Buddha refuses to answer the question, saying only that "where there is *no* noble eightfold path" (atth'angiko maggo na upalabbhati) the 4 kinds of recluses (samana) are not found:

But, Subhadda, in whatever Dharma and Vinaya, where the noble eightfold path is found,

the recluse of the first kind [streamwinner] is found therein, the recluse of the second kind [once-returner] is found therein, the recluse of the third kind [non-returner] is found therein, the recluse of the fourth kind [arhat] is found therein.

<u>Empty of recluses are the other outside doctrines</u>, ¹³ but, Subhadda, if these monks were to live rightly here [in this teaching], this world will not be empty of arhats.

I was 29 years of age, Subhadda, Now over 50 years have passed¹⁴ Beyond the realm of the right way, that is the Dharma.¹⁵ when I went forth, seeking for the good. since the day that I went forth, Subhadda.

there is no recluse (*ito bahiddhā samaṇo pi n'atthi*). (D 16,5.27/2:151). SD 9^{16}

3.1.2 This declaration should not be interpreted as a triumphalist and exclusivist statement. It simply reflects the religious conditions of the Buddha's time. It should be balanced with the Buddha's declaration in **the Puppha Sutta** (S 22.94):

"I do not quarrel with the world, bhikshus, but the world quarrels with me. One who speaks Dharma does not quarrel with anyone in the world. Of that to which the wise men of the world do not assent, I, too, say that it is not so. Of that to which the wise men of the world assent, I too say that it is so."

(S 22.94/3:138), SD 72.5.

66

¹² On the arhat, further see SD 40a.8 (2.3.3) & esp SD 10.16 (14).

¹³ Suññā para-p,pavādā samaṇehi aññe. Comy says that "other sects" are the proponents of the 62 views, who lack the 12 kinds of ascetics, viz, the 4 who have attained the fruits (*phal'aṭṭhaka,samaṇa*), the 4 who have attained the path (*magg'aṭṭhaka,samaṇa*), and the 4 working on insight (*āraddha,vipassaka samaṇa*) to attain the respective paths (AA 3:214). This sentence forms part of a longer lion-roar (*sīha,nāda*) at Cūṭa Sīha,nāda S (M 11,2.2), SD 49.2 & (Catukka) Samaṇa S (A 4.239/2:238,9), SD 49.14. The latter elaborates on the *italicized* statements see main Sutta translation below.

¹⁴ On these dates, see SD 47.12 (1.2) n on Rāhula.

¹⁵ "The right way that is the wholesome truth" ($\tilde{n}\bar{a}ya$ kusala dhamma): see n in (**Brahma,vihāra**) Subha S (M 99,4/2:197), SD 38.6.

¹⁶ The next two paras at M 1:63 f & A 2:138.

¹⁷ "Here the Buddha emphasizes that he does not reject all ontological propositions, but only those that transcend the bounds of possible experience" (S:B 1085 n185). See also Gethin 2001:261. See SD 49.21 (2.3.3).

3.2 "WHERE THE NOBLE EIGHTFOLD PATH IS FOUND"

3.2.0 The key sentence here is clearly, "where the noble eightfold path is found" (atth' angiko maggo upalabbhati). The "noble eightfold path" clearly refers to the 3 trainings (ti, $sikkh\bar{a}$), that is, the training in moral virtue, in mental concentration, and in wisdom.

3.2.1 Moral training

- 3.2.1.1 In simple terms, **the training in moral virtue** ($sila,sikkh\bar{a}$) comprises the disciplining or refining of the body and speech by way of the 5 precepts and further moral training for the laity¹⁸ and for monastics.¹⁹ In the case of the monastics, their training includes the renunciation of all wealth, sexual conduct and worldly ways so that they are not distracted by the world.²⁰
- 3.2.1.2 The monastic rules and training handed down through the monastic lineages to this day comprise the 4 full purifications by way of moral virtue (*catu,pārisuddhi sīla*), that is:

(1) restraint with regard to the monastic code,
 (2) sense-restraint,
 (3) full purification of livelihood, and
 (4) moral conduct regarding the 4 requisites,
 (5) pātimokkha,saṁvara sīla
 (6) indriya,saṁvara,sīla
 (7) indriya,saṁvara,sīla
 (8) pātimokkha,saṁvara sīla
 (9) pātimokkha,saṁvara sīla
 (10) pātimokkha,saṁvara sīla
 (11) purification of livelihood, and
 (12) pātimokkha,saṁvara sīla
 (13) parisuddhi sīla
 (14) parisuddhi sīla
 (15) paccaya,sannissita sīla
 (15) paccaya,sannissita sīla

- 3.2.1.3 The <u>restraint with regard to the monastic code</u> is that of keeping to the various grades of rules that define a monastic, prescribe rehabilitation that he has undergo, lay down methods of dealing with unallowable acquisitions, wrong conduct and so on. This is the code that legally holds a community together and which sustains the living spirit of monasticism and renunciation as taught by the Buddha.
- 3.1.2.4 <u>Sense-restraint</u> is a monastic's habitual practice of avoiding any kind of unwholesome attending to sense-experiences. The sense-doors are guarded by way of our rejecting the very first sign (*nimitta*) of an unwholesome sense-stimulus, so that one is not ensnared by its details (*vyañjana*). In short, this is the custody of the senses.²²
- 3.2.1.5 <u>Full purification of livelihood</u> refers to the monastic's life as a whole, especially how he receives support from the laity, and how he treats them—these should be proper, that is, not against monastic rules and decorum, that is, the first two principles and the following one. Monastics do not accept any form of payment or bribery. Only suitable gifts and proper giving, out of faith, are acceptable by the monastics.²³ Further, monastics should not engage in any kind of trade, entertainment, or worldly activities—such prohibitions are listed in the "moralities" (*sīla*) sections of the first 13 suttas of the Dīgha Nikāya.²⁴
- 3.2.1.6 <u>Moral conduct regarding the 4 requisites</u>, that is, the proper way of obtaining, using and general attitude towards the basic supports of life: almsfood, robes, shelter and health support. These supports should be allowable and properly obtained. They are meant to be reflectively used—reminding ourself that they are merely used for the sake of facilitating our progress in the spiritual life.²⁵

3.2.2 Mental cultivation

3.2.2.1 **The training in mental concentration** (*samādhi,sikkhā*) is the cultivation of the mind to remove distractions from the body (that is, the 5 physical senses) through various forms of mindfulness and meditation practices as a spiritual exercise in renunciation of the body. This is the basis for the renuncia-

¹⁸ On the 5 precepts, see **Veļu,dvāreyya S** (S 55.7), SD 1.5 (2); *Sīlānussati*, SD 15.11 (2.2); also SD 21.6 (1.2) & SD 37.8 (2.2). On the laity observing celibacy with the 5 precepts (*brahma,cariya,pañcama sikkhā,pada*), see **Hatthi,gāmaka Ugga S** (A 8.22,6.5), SD 45.15.

¹⁹On moral training for monastics, see SD 10.16 (5.4.2).

²⁰ See also **Money and monastics**, SD 4.19-23.

²¹ Vism 1.25/11, elaborated in Vism 1.26-135/11-47, See SD 48.9 (2.2).

²² See *Nimitta & anuvyañjana*, SD 19.14.

²³ See SD 37.8 (1.4.3).

²⁴ See eg **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1,8-27/1:4-11), SD 25; also SD 8.10 (3); SD 10.16 (1.6.1).

²⁵ On the reflections on the requisites, see **Sabb'āsava S** (M 2,13-16), SD 30.3 & **Santuṭṭhi S** (A 4.27), SD 104.8.

tion of the mind, that is, letting go of all views and thoughts as a spiritual exercise. Properly done, this leads to mental concentration ($sam\bar{a}dhi$), and with further cultivation, this brings about various dhyanas.²⁶

3.2.2.2 **The Sikkhā Sutta 1** (A 3.85) explains the relationship between the 3 trainings and the attaining of sainthood, thus:

<u>The streamwinner</u> is fully accomplished in moral virtue but is limited in concentration and wisdom.

<u>The once-returner</u> is like the streamwinner, but he has weakened the 3 unwholesome roots [2.2].

<u>The non-returner</u> is fully accomplished in moral virtue and concentration, but is limited in wisdom.

<u>The arhat</u> is fully accomplished in moral virtue, concentration and wisdom.

(A 3.85), SD 3.3(2))

Hence, the first three kinds of saints are said to be "learners" (*sekha*), while only the arhat is one who is a "non-learner" (*asekha*), as adept, because he has mastered all the 3 trainings.²⁷

3.2.3 Wisdom training

- 3.2.3.1 **The training in wisdom** ($pa\tilde{n}\tilde{n}$, $sikkh\bar{a}$) refers to our knowledge and understanding of the nature of our being and how we can free ourself from <u>ignorance</u> (not knowing what is right and good) and <u>craving</u> (doing what is wrong and bad). Wisdom then begins with the knowledge which teaches us right personal and social conduct (moral virtue) and good mental habits (mental cultivation).
- 3.2.3.2 Even if we have a good teacher, we still need to carefully search the suttas and master their teaching. The suttas are the real "gold standard" for theoretical Dharma (*pariyatti*). With proper meditation instructions from an experienced teacher, we then meditate to cultivate calm and clarity of mind.

Then, we examine the suttas again, and link up what we know of the suttas and personal experience, allowing joy to arise in us as we experience the truth and beauty of the Dharma. The <u>truth</u> of the Dharma helps us cut down our ignorance and increase our insight into true reality. The <u>beauty</u> of the Dharma is the *joy* we feel, and which sustains our interest in studying the suttas and knowing Dharma. This is a vital part of our practice (*paṭipatti*).

3.2.3.3 The <u>streamwinner's</u> wisdom frees him from identifying with the body, from relying on any outside agency for what arises in the mind, and from any doubt about his potential and ability for self-awakening. The <u>once-returner's</u> wisdom is similar to that of the streamwinner's, except that he is able to free himself a bit more from seeing his body more than what it really is: impermanent and unsatisfactory.

The <u>non-returner</u>'s wisdom is based on deep meditation, that is, dhyana. In other words, he has risen above all attachment to the body and sensual pleasures. Hence, he does not return (he is no more reborn) to the sense-world (of which our world is a part). He is reborn in the pure abodes where he goes on to become an arhat.

The <u>arhat's</u> wisdom is closer to that of the Buddha's than any other kind of wisdom. Both the Buddha and the arhat gain the same awakening, that is, they attain nirvana and are no more reborn [2.4]. Since the arhat is free from all views (notions arising from greed, hate, delusion or fear), he is said to have "given up both good and bad" (*puñña*, *papa*, *pahīna*). This also means that the arhat is unconcerned with merit—which bring "blessings" and good rebirth, but it also chains us to the wheel of rebirths and redeaths.²⁸

3.3 "OUTSIDERS"

3.3.1 The suttas sometimes use the term *bāhira* or *bāhiraka*, both meaning "outsider" to refer to the unawakened, especially worldlings who have not touched the noble eightfold path. Here, the supramundane path—those of the streamwinner, the once-returner, the non-returner and the arhat—is meant. We are only "insiders" when we attain at least streamwinning, that is, we are on the way to awakening. We see such usage in **the Cūļa Hatthi,padôpama Sutta** (M 27)²⁹ and **the Dakkhiṇa Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 142).

²⁶ On dhyana, see **Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

²⁷ On the 3 trainings, see *Sīla samadhi paññā*, SD 21.6.

²⁸ SD 2.10 (3.2.3.4).

 $^{^{29}}$ M 27,25.4) n + SD 40a.5 (1.1.2).

³⁰ M 142,5(11)) + nn, SD 1.9; see also SD 47.1 (1.1.2).

The term "outsider" is not used here in an exclusive sense, but rather to emphasize on the urgency of attaining at least streamwinning so that we are safe from the vicissitude and sufferings of the world. By attaining the path, we are empowered to deal with the world, and better equipped to help those still caught up in it. The task of a true Buddhist, then, is to aspire to at least attain streamwinning in this life itself.³¹

3.3.2 Elsewhere, such as in **the** (**Sotāpanna**) **Nandiya Sutta** (S 55.40), it is stated that only <u>stream-winners</u> and the other saints are *not* "outsiders."³² The significance of the statement is the same as that of the suttas above [3.3.1]. Outsiders or worldlings who have not started their journey on the path are like students outside the university, who are working to qualify themselves to enter it or have yet to apply to join it.

The mundane path of moral training, mental cultivation and wisdom training—especially centering around the universal reality of impermanence—prepares us as "good worldlings" (*kalyāṇa puthujjana*) to reach the noble eightfold path and start our journey of awakening. How this can be effectively done—with a guarantee by the Buddha himself of our attaining streamwinning in this life itself—is given in all the ten suttas of **the Okkanta Saṁyutta** (S 25).

4 Awakening is gradual

4.1 THE TRAINING PROGRESS

4.1.1 According to early Buddhism, awakening is <u>gradual</u> (*anupubbena*). This is evident both from the sequence of the 4 kinds of noble individuals, and from how each of them are defined relative to one another in terms of the 10 fetters [1.1.1]. The 3 trainings, too, are a progressive process: moral virtue helping mental concentration, which in turn help moral virtue, and both helping the arising of wisdom, which in turn enhances the other two processes: all happening pari passu (more or less at the same rate), progressing ahead.

4.1.2 The progress of the 3 trainings is gradual. This is evident in this passage in **the Agārava Sutta 2** (A 5.23), thus:

Bhikshus, when a monk

is disrespectful and irreverent, and his conduct is uncongenial to his fellow brahmacharis,

it is impossible for him to fulfill the factor of proper conduct (abhisamācārika dhamma).

Without fulfilling the factor of proper conduct,

it is impossible for him to fulfill the factor of a trainee³³ (sekha dhamma).

Without fulfilling the factor of a trainee,

it is impossible for him to fulfill the aggregate of moral virtue (sīla-k,khandha).

Without fulfilling the aggregate of moral virtue,

it is impossible for him to fulfill the aggregate of concentration (samādhi-k,khandha).

Without fulfilling the aggregate of concentration,

it is impossible for him to fulfill the aggregate of wisdom (paññā-k,khandha).

(A 5.22/2:16), SD 74.21

The shorter **Agārava Sutta 1** (A 5.22) says about the same thing giving the teaching sequence as "factor of proper conduct," "factor of a trainee," "the precepts" $(s\bar{\imath}l\bar{a}ni)$, "right view" $(samm\bar{a},ditthi)$, and ends with "right concentration" $(samm\bar{a},sam\bar{a}dhi)$.³⁴ The longer Agārava Sutta 2 clearly refers to monastic training, while the shorter, applies to lay practice.³⁵ The passage relates how one training is the basis for the next.

http://dharmafarer.org

³¹ See **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3.

 $^{^{32}}$ S 55.40,4 + $\stackrel{\smile}{\text{SD}}$ 47.1 (1.1.2).

³³ Clearly, the context here refers to a monastic trainee (*sekha*, lit, "a learner"), not a path-saint.

³⁴ A 5.22/2:15 (SD 74.20).

 $^{^{35}}$ A similar sequence, but relating to the 3 kinds of lust $(r\bar{a}ga)$, is given in **the (Chakka) Mitta Sutta** (A 6.67). The 3 kinds of lust $(r\bar{a}ga)$ are those for sensual pleasures $(k\bar{a}ma, r\bar{a}ga)$, for form existence $(r\bar{u}pa, r\bar{a}ga)$ and for formless existence $(ar\bar{u}pa, r\bar{a}ga)$: A 6.67/3:422 (SD 64.19).

4.2 THE THEORY OF MOMENTS CONTROVERSY

4.2.1 After the Buddha's time, the leading Buddhist thinkers who were inclined towards a philosophical approach, thought that we are either awakened or not (in an Aristotelian way, we might say). In fact, the Abhidhamma tradition—probably in response to the Mahāyāna ideas—developed a "theory of moments" (*khaṇika,vāda*).

According to this view, the body endures just like the light of a lamp burns through the night "by way of a connected continuity" (*paveṇi,sambandha,vasena*), even though the flame ceases right where it burns without crossing over to the next part of the wick (SA 2:99).³⁷ This is interesting and helpful in describing what *appears* to be occurring, like describing the dynamic nature of atoms and molecules. A diagram of an atom shows them to be "particles," but we can also understand them as "waves."³⁸

4.2.2 The Abhidhamma tradition suggests that the stages of sainthood are but "moments." **The Dakkhiṇa Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 142) relates how alms is being given to the 8 kinds of saints, that is, an arhat, an arhat-to-be, a non-returner, ³⁹ a non-returner-to-be, a once-returner, a once-returner-to-be, a streamwinner and a streamwinner-to-be. This shows that the saints-to-be (those "on the path") must take time to consume their meals. Hence, they cannot be mere mind-moments (as claimed by the Abhidhammikas) but last for a significant duration. ⁴⁰

5 Simplified definitions of the noble individuals

In simple terms, we define the 4 kinds of noble individuals or saints as follows:

- **5.1 THE STREAMWINNER** is a saint or "noble individual" (*ariya,puggala*) who understands and accepts the true nature of his body, that it is impermanent and conditioned by the mind. Hence, personal development and spiritual growth depend on personal effort, free from any doubt that it is not only efficacious, but the best way of awakening from suffering. The Dharma frees him from superstition and negative emotions to gain true happiness. He is certain of awakening in this life itself.⁴¹
- **5.2 THE ONCE-RETURNER** is a saint who, having overcome self-centredness, doubt and superstition, further frees himself from the negative roots of motivation, that is, greed, hate and delusion. As a result of his greater non-attachment to his body—in terms of being attractive or unattractive, and understanding their impermanence, change and conditionality—he weakens his negative karma so that he has only one more happy human life to go, at the end of which he attains awakening as an arhat.⁴²
- **5.3 THE NON-RETURNER** is a saint who has overcome all attachments to the body in terms of sense-experiences, that is, as a source of pleasure. He has a deep understanding of the impermanence, unsatisfactoriness and non-self of the body and mind, on account of his mastery of deep meditation, that is, dhyana. Since he has no attachment to the human body, on passing away, he is reborn in one of the pure abodes, inhabited only by non-returners, where he will finally attain arhathood and nirvana.⁴³
- **5.4 THE ARHAT** is a saint who has destroyed all the defilements or fetters that hold him back in this world, causing suffering and rebirth. The arhat has overcome all attachments: in terms of the body as well as the mind. In other words, he has removed even the finer aspects of selfhood, that is, he has overcome

³⁶ On this Aristotelian dichotomy, see SD 26.9 (4.1.3); SD 40a.1 (7.2.1). It would be interesting to examine the rise of Mahāyāna philosophy in terms of the influence of Greek philosophy and early Christianity.

³⁷ Cf **Assutava S 1** (S 12.16) which speaks of arising and ceasing rapidly (SD 12.61,6-8), SD 20.1 & SD 26.9 (1.6.3). The suttas, however, never speak of "mind-moments" (*citta-k,khana*), which is an Abhidhamma concept.

³⁸ On the later Buddhist idea of atomism, see SD 26.2 esp (2.3).

³⁹ On the duration of a non-returner's life, see SD 2.3 (1.1.3(2)).

⁴⁰ See **Dakkhiṇa Vibhaṅga S** (M 142,3-10) n, SD 1.9. Cf **(Hatthi,gāmaka) Ugga S** (A 8.22), where Ugga similarly offers alms to monks who are have variously attained some level of sainthood (A 8.22,10), SD 45.15. See also SD 2.3 (1.1.3(2)).

⁴¹ On streamwinning and attaining it in this life itself, see (**Anicca**) **Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7. For details on the streamwinner, see SD 10.16 (11).

⁴² For details on the once-returner, see SD 10.16 (12).

⁴³ For details on the non-returner, see SD 10.16 (13).

conceit (measuring self with others), restlessness (uneasiness over the manifestations of greed, hate and delusion) and, above all, ignorance—he has completely understood the 4 noble truths in all their aspects.

The arhat's awakening is the same as that of the Buddha's—just as fire is put out, so are all the fires of greed, hate and delusion quenched in the arhat. Like the Buddha, the arhat, too, will not be reborn any more. He does not need to become a buddha because their minds are liberated in the same way. The only difference is that the Buddha is the discoverer of the path, and the arhats are fully awakened followers.⁴⁴

The (Fours) Discourse on the Recluse

A 4.239

Lion-roar

1 Only here, bhikshus, are there the first recluse, the second recluse, the third recluse, the fourth recluse.⁴⁵

1.2 Empty of recluses are the other outside systems ⁴⁶—thus, bhikshus, you rightly roar the lion-roar! ⁴⁷

The streamwinner

2 And what, bhikshus, is the first recluse?

2.2 ⁴⁸Here, bhikshus, a monk, one whose 3 fetters⁵⁰ are totally destroyed, is **a streamwinner**, no longer bound for the lower world, ⁵¹

tiṇṇaṁ saṁyojanānaṁ parikkhayā sotāpanno hoti avinipāta,dhammo

http://dharmafarer.org

⁴⁴ See **Sambuddha S** (S 22.58), SD 49.10. For details on the arhat, see SD 10.16 (14).

⁴⁵ Idh'eva bhikkhave samano, idha dutiyo samano, idha tatiyo samano, idha catuttho samano.

⁴⁶ Comy alludes to the Buddha's renunciation verse (§5.27.3) to Subhadda, the last disciple to be admitted before the Buddha, in **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16), closing with the words: "There are no recluses outside of this" (*ito bahiddhā samaņo pi n'atthi*) (D 16,5.27.3/2:151), SD 9 (AA 3:214). On the Pali, see foll n.

⁴⁷ Suññā para-p,pavādā samaṇehi aññe'ti, [Be:Ka Ce Ee so; Be samaṇehi aññehîti] / evam etam bhikkhave sam-mā sīha,nādam nadatha. This first half of the sentence (ending with aññe) recurs in **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,-5.27.3/2:151,22), SD 9. The whole sentence recurs—with the same variance in readings—in **Cūļa Sīha,nāda S** (M 11,2.2/1:63,30), SD 49.2. Comy says that "other sects" are the proponents of the 62 views, who lack the 12 kinds of ascetics, viz, the 4 who have attained the fruits (phal'aṭṭhaka,samaṇa), the 4 who have attained the path (magg'aṭṭhaka,samaṇa), and the 4 working on insight (āraddha,vipassaka samaṇa) to attain the respective paths (AA 3:214).

⁴⁸ Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu tiṇṇaṁ saṃyojanānaṁ parikkhayā sotāpanno hoti avinipāta,dhammo niyato sambodhi,parāyaṇo. This <u>sotāpanna pericope</u> is found at: **Mahāli S** (D 6,13/1:156), SD 53.4; **Pāsādika S** (D 29,25/3:132), SD 40a.6; **Sarakāni Sakka S 1** (S 55.24,9/5:376), SD 3.6; **Sarakāni Sakka S 2** (S 55.25/5:379), SD 77.8; **Sikkha-t,taya S 1** (A 3.88/1:232), SD 24,10c; **Sikkha-t,taya S 2** (A 3.89/1:233); **Sikkha-t,taya S 3** (A 3.90/1:235) **Sama-na-m-acala S 2** (A 4.88/2:89), SD 20.14; (**Catukka) Samaṇa S** (A 4.239/2:238), SD 49.14; **Udakûpamā S** (A 7.15/4:12), SD 28.6; **Sa,upādi,sesa S** (A 9.12/4:378), SD 3.3(3); **Eka Pug** (Pug 1.31-33/16); **Catukka Pug** (Pug 4.29/63); **Sattaka Pug** (Pug 7.1/72). On <u>streamwinning</u> in this life itself, see (**Anicca**) **Cakkhu S** (SD 25.1), SD 16.7.

⁴⁹ "Monk" (*bhikkhu*) as referring to the <u>state</u> of "monkness" (*bhikkhu,bhāva*) in anyone who meditates, see **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10,3A) + n, SD 13.3; also SD 13.1 (3.1.1.5); SD 16.7 (1.1.1.2).

⁵⁰ They are: (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*). They are part of the 10 mental fetters: see [§4 n] below.

⁵¹ Avinīpāta, alt tr "not fated for birth in a suffering state"; opp of vinīpāta, "the world of suffering," another name for the 4 woeful courses (duggati) or the 4 lower worlds (apāya) (Vism 13.92 f). Sometimes 5 destinies or courses

surely going over to self-awakening.⁵² This, bhikshus, is the first recluse.⁵³

niyato sambodhi,parāyaņo

The once-returner

3 And what, bhikshus, is the second recluse?

3.2 ⁵⁴Here, bhikshus, a monk, whose 3 fetters⁵⁵ are destroyed, and with the diminishing of lust, hate and delusion, is a **once-returner**, returning only once to this world to make an end of suffering.⁵⁶

This, bhikshus, is the second recluse.⁵⁷

The non-returner

4 And what, bhikshus, is **the third recluse**?

4.2 ⁵⁸Here, bhikshus, a monk, with the destruction of the 5 lower fetters, ⁵⁹ is **spontaneously reborn**⁶⁰

tiṇṇaṁ saṁyojanānaṁ parikkhayā rāga,dosa,mohānaṁ tanuttā sakadāgāmī hoti sakid eva imaṁ lokaṁ āgantvā dukkhass'antaṁ karoti.

[pañcannam orambhāgiyānam samyojanānam parikkhayā opapātiko hoti

(pañca,gati) (D 33,2.1; A 11.68) are mentioned: the hells (niraya), the animal birth (tiracchāna,yoni), the preta realm (pitti,visaya), the human world (manussa) and the heavenly world (deva). Of these, the first three are woeful, with the asura-demons (asura,kāya) as the fourth woeful course. The remaining two are "happy courses" (sugati). [1.7.3.2]. For a discussion, see Nyanaponika & Bodhi (tr), Numerical Discourses of the Buddha, 1999:14-19.

⁵² On streamwinning and attaining it in this life itself, see (**Anicca**) **Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7. For details on the streamwinner, see SD 10.16 (11).

⁵³ See (1.1.1.1).

⁵⁴ Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu tiṇṇam samyojanānam parikkhayā raga,dosa,mohānam tanuttā sakadāgāmī hoti, sakid eva imam lokam āgantvā dukkhass'antam karoti. This sakadāgāmī pericope is found at: **Mahāli S** (D 6,13/1:156), SD 53.4; **Sarakāṇi S 1** (S 55.24,7.5/5:376), SD 3.6; **Sarakāṇi S 2** (S 55.25/5:378), SD 77.8; (**Sekha) Uddesa S 1** (A 3.85/1:232), SD 3.3(2); (**Sekha) Uddesa S 2** (A 3.86/1:234), SD 80.13; **Sikkhā S 3** (A 3.87/1:234), SD 80.14; **Samaṇa-m-acala S 2** (A 4.88,5/2:89), SD 20.14; (**Catukka) Samaṇa S** (A 4.239/2:238), SD 49.14; **Udakûpamā S** (A 7.15,9.2/4:13), SD 28.6; **Catukka Pug** (Pug 4.27/62, 29/63); **Sattaka Pug** (Pug 7.1/72).

⁵⁵ See §2.2 n above.

⁵⁶ For details on the once-returner, see SD 10.16 (12).

⁵⁷ See (1.1.1.1).

⁵⁸ Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu pañcannam orambhāgiyānam samyojanānam parikkhayā opapātiko hoti tattha parinibbāyī anāvatti,dhammo tasmā lokā. This <u>anāgāmi</u> pericope is at: **Mahāli S** (D 6,13/1:156), SD 53.4; **Maha,parinibbāna S** (D 16/2:92×2), SD 9; **Pāsādika S** (D 29,25/3:132), SD 40a.6; **Aṭṭhaka,nāgara S** (M 52/1:350, 352), SD 41.2; **Mahā Māluṅkya S** (M 64/1:437), SD 21.10; (**Majjhima**) **Ghaṭikāra S** (M 81/2:52), SD 49.3; **Veļu,dvāreyya S** (S 55.7/5:358, 359), SD 1.5; **Sarakāṇi S 1** (S 55.24,7.5/5:376), SD 3.6; (**Sekha**) **Uddesa S 1** (A 3.85/1:232), SD 3.3(2); (**Sekha**) **Uddesa S 2** (A 3.86/1:232), SD 80.13; **Sikkhā S 3** (A 3.87/1:233), SD 80.14; **Ājāniya S 1** (A 3.96/1:245); **Assa,parassa S** (A 3.141/1:290×3); **Anusota S** (A 4.5/2:5); **Samaṇa-m-acala S 2** (A 4.88,5/2:89), SD 20.-14; (**Catukka**) **Samaṇa S** (A 4.239/2:238), SD 49.14; **Udakûpamā S** (A 7.15/4:12), SD 28.6; (**Navaka**) **Assa,khaluṅka S** (A 9.22/4:399), SD 73.7; (**Āsava-k,khaya**) **Jhāna S** (A 9.36/4:423, 424×2, 425, 426×2), SD 33.8; **Dasama S** (A 11.16/5:343, 344×2, 345, 346×2); **Catukka Pug** (Pug 4.41-42/16, 43-46/17; 27/62, 29/63); **Sattaka Pug** (Pug 7.203/72). See also (**Tika**) **Monevya S** (A 3.120,5), SD 49.21.

⁵⁹ They fetter us to the lower realms of existence (the sense worlds). **The 10 fetters** (*dasa,samyojanā*) are: (1) Personality view (*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parā-māsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma,rāga*), (5) repulsion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa,rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa,rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*) (S 5:61, A 5:13, Vbh 377). In some places, no. 5 (*paṭigha*) is replaced by ill will (*vyāpāda*). The first 5 are the lower fetters (*orambhāgiya*), and the rest, the higher fetters (*uddhambhāgiya*).

and there attain final nirvana, without ever returning from that world.⁶¹ This, bhikshus, is the third recluse.⁶²

tattha parinibbāyī anāvatti,dhammo tasmā lokā

The arhat

- 5 And what, bhikshus, is **the fourth recluse**?
- 5.2 ⁶³Here, bhikshus, a monk, ⁶⁴

http://dharmafarer.org 73

⁶⁰ As a non-returner, reborn in the Pure Abodes (suddh'āvāsa), the 5 highest heavens of the form world (rūpa,-loka) inhabited only by non-returners who assume their last birth to become arhats and attain nirvana. These worlds are Āviha ("Non-declining"), Ātappa ("Unworried"), Sudassā ("Clearly Visible"), Sudassā ("Clear-visioned") and Akaṇiṭṭhā ("Highest") (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46). It should be noted that one could become a non-returner in this world itself, but upon dying, one is reborn in the Pure Abodes.

⁶¹ For details on the non-returner, see SD 10.16 (13).

⁶² See (1.1.1.1).

⁶³ Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu āsavānam khayā anāsavam ceto,vimuttim paññā,vimuttim diṭṭh'eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampaija viharati. This is the vimutti arhathood pericope, more commonly found as a standalone def of arhathood. (A) As part of a set with the other 3 pericopes: Mahāli S (D 6,13/1:156), SD 53.4; Sarakāṇi S 1 (S 55.24,7.5/5:376), SD 3.6; Sarakāṇi S 2 (S 55.25/5:378), SD 77.8; (Sekha) Uddesa S 1 (A 3.85/-1:232), SD 3.3(2); (Sekha) Uddesa S 2 (A 3.86/1:234), SD 80.13; Sikkhā S 3 (A 3.87/1:234), SD 80.14; Samanam-acala S 2 (A 4.88,5/2:89), SD 20.14; (Catukka) Samaṇa S (A 4.239/2:238), SD 49.14; Udakûpamā S (A 7.15,-9.2/4:13), SD 28.6; Catukka Pug (Pug 4.27/62, 4.29/63); Sattaka Pug (Pug 7.1/72); and (B) as stand-alone or vimutti arhathood pericope: Kassapa Sīha,nāda S (D 8,15-17/1:167-171), SD 73.12; Mahā,nidāna S (D 15/2:271), SD 5.17, ending; Mahā,parinibbāna S (D 16/2:92), SD 9; Mahā Govinda S (D 19/2:251), SD 63.4; Cakka,vatti Sīha,nādaS (D 26/3:78), SD 36.10; Sampasādanīya S (D 28/3:102, 107, 108), SD 14.14; Pāsādika S (D 29,25/-1:132), SD 40a.6; Das'uttara S (D 34,1.7(10f)/3:281); Mahā Sīha,nāda S (M 12/1:71, 74, 76, 77), SD 49.1; Cūla Assa,pura S (M 40/1:284). SD 41.8; Sālevvaka S (M 41/1:289), SD 5.7; Verañja S (M 42/1:291); Sekha S (M 53/1:357 f), SD 21.14; (Gaha,pati) Potaliva S (M 54/1:367), SD 43.8; Te,vijia Vaccha,gotta S (M 71/1:482), SD 53.3; Mahā Vaccha,gotta S (M 73/1:490, 496), SD 27.4; Mahā Sakul'udāvi S (M 77/2:22), SD 49.5; Go,pāka Moggallāna S (M 108/3:12), SD 33.5; Kāya,gata,sati S (M 119/3:99), SD 12.21; Saṅkhār'upapatti S (M 120/3:-103), SD 3.4; Nandak'ovāda S (M 146/3:275, 275, 277), SD 66.12; Jhānâbhiññā S (S 16.9/2:214), SD 50.7; Upassaya S (S 16.10/2:217), SD 92.7; Cīvara S (S 16.11/2:222), SD 77.5; (Pañc'indriya) Āsavak-k,khaya S (S 48.20/5:203); Sāketa S (S 48.43/5:220); (Iddhi,pāda) Bhikkhu S 1 (S 51.7/5:257×6); (Iddhi,pāda) Pubba S (S 51.11/5:266); Maha-p.phala S (S 51.12/5:268); (Pasāda Kampana) Moggallāna (S 51.14/5:271), SD 27.8; (Iddhi,pāda) Bhikkhu S 2 (S 51.18/5:275, 276); Iddhi,pāda Vibhaṅga S (S 51.20/5:281), SD 28.14; Magga S (S 51.21/5:282); (Iddhi,pāda) Bhikkhu S 3 (S 51.23/5:284); (Iddhi) Moggallāna S (S 51.31/5:289), SD 27.7; (Iddhi,pāda) Tathāgata S (S 51.32/5:290); Giñjak'avasatha S 1 (S 55.8/5:356); Giñjak'avasatha S 2 (S 55.9/5:358); Vassam, vuttha S (S 55.52/5:406); (Tika) Sāranīya S (A 3.12/1:107, 108×2, 109×3), SD 72.1; Bahu, kāra S (A 3.24/1:123); Vajirûpama S (A 3.25/1:124); Mahānāma Sakka S (A 3.73/1:220); Nigantha S (A 3.74/1:221); Sikkha-t-,taya S 2 (A 3.89/1:236), SD 47.8; Ājāniya S 3 (A 3.96/1:246); Paṁsu,dhovaka S (A 3.100a/1:256), SD 19.11; Moneyva S (A 3.120/1:273); Ass'ājāniya S (A 3.139/1:291); Anusota S (A 4.5/2:6), SD 78.15; Uruvela S 2 (A 4.22/2:23); (Mahā,purisa) Vassa,kāra S (A 4.35/2:36×3, 37), SD 82.9; Samana-macala S 1 (A 4.87/2:87×2, 88×2), SD 20.13; (Taṇhā) Bhikkhuṇī S (A 4.159/2:146×4), SD 10.14; Pema S (A 4.200/2:214);(Nīvaraṇa) Upakkilesa S (S 5.23/3:19), SD 74.3; (Samādhi) Pañc'aṅgika S (A 5.28/3:29), SD 33.13; Iddhi,pāda S 2 (A 5.68/3:83), SD 106.16; (Pañcaka) Sīlavanta S (A 5.87/3:114); Phāsu, vihara S (A 5.94/3:119); Samana Sukhumāla S (A 5.-104/3:131); (Asekha) Ānanda S (A 5.106/3:134); Cātu-d,disa S (A 5.109/3:135); (Pañcaka) Arañña S (A 5.110/-3:135); (Pañcaka) Gilāna S (A 5.121/3:142); (Pañcaka) Piya S (A 5.232/3:262); (Chakka) Āhuneyya S 2 (A 6.2/-3:281); (Chakka) Indriva S (A 6.3/3:282); (Pañcaka) Bala S (A 6.4/3:282); Soppa S (A 6.17/3:300, 301); Arakkheyya S (A 7.55/4:83×2); Pāricchattakûpama S (A 7.65/4:119×2); Vinaya,dhara S 1 (A 7.71/4:140); Vinaya,dhara S 2 (A 7.72/4:141); Vinaya,dhara S 3 (A 7.73/4:141); Vinaya,dhara S 4 (A 7.74/4:141); (Sattaka) Āhunevva Sutta (A 7.95/4:145); (Atthaka) Saddhā S 1 (A 8.1/4:314, 315, 316); (Navaka) Assa Khaluṅka S (A 9.22/-4:400), SD 73.7; (Pabbateyya) Gāvī S (A 9.36/4:422), SD 24.3; (Dasaka) Jhāna S (A 10.8/5:10, 11×2); Santa Vimokkha S (A 10.9/5:11, 12×2); Vijjā S (A 10.10/5:14); Senāsana S (A 10.11/5:15), SD 96.5; (Dasaka) Sīha, nāda S (A 10.21/5:36); Adhimutti,pada S (A 10.22/5:38); Kosala S 2 (A 10.30/5:69); Ākaṅkha S (A 10.71/5:-133), SD 82.12; (Dasaka) Āhunevya S (A 10.97/5:200); (Dasaka) Thera S (A 10.98/5:201); (Saddha) Subhūti S

by realizing for himself through direct knowledge, 65	sayaṁ abhiññā sacchikatvā	f
right here and now,	diṭṭh'eva dhamme	c
with the destruction of the mental influxes, ⁶⁶	āsavānaṁ khayā	a
attains and dwells	upasampajja viharati	b
in the influx-free	anāsavam	d
freedom of mind, freedom by wisdom. ⁶⁷	ceto,vimuttiṁ paññā,vimuttiṁ	e
This, bhikshus, is the fourth recluse. ⁶⁸	•	

6 Only here, bhikshus, are there the first recluse, the second recluse, the third recluse, the fourth recluse.

Empty of recluses are the other outside systems—thus, bhikshus, you rightly roar the lion-roar!

— evam —

[For **Bibliography**, see the end of SD 49c]

161019 161025 161218

(A 11.15/5:340), SD 45.1(4.2); (**Arahatta**) **Nanda S** (U 3.2/23×3, 24×2), SD 43.7; **Deva,sadda S** (It 3.4.3/75); **Kalyāṇa,sīla S** (It 3.5.8/97); (**Tika**) **Te,vijja S** (It 3.5.10/100); Vbh 334; **Tika Pug** (Pug 3.1/27×2, 3.2/28×2, 3.3/-27×2, 3.5/30×2, 3.12/35). Cf *abbhaññāsi* (or essential arhathood) pericope, with names of arhats: SD 47.1 (3.2.2.3). ⁶⁴ The foll stock is perhaps the oldest def of arhathood, on account of (1) its relative brevity, (2) rare occurrence,

and (3) mention in a brief sutta.

⁶⁵ For details on the arhat, see SD 10.16 (14).

⁶⁶ "Mental influxes," *āsava*, also tr as "cankers, corruptions." The term *āsava* (lit "inflow, outflow") comes from *ā-savati* "flows towards" (ie either "into" or "out" towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints ("deadly taints", RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 *āsava*: the influxes of (1) sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav'āsava*), (3) views (*diṭṭh'āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjâsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as "floods" (*oghā*) and "yokes" (*yogā*). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is prob older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsava* is equivalent to arhathood. On this def, see (Catukka) Samaṇa S (A 4.239, 5.2) n, SD 49.14. See BDict under āsava.

⁶⁷ The one <u>freed of mind</u> has destroyed all the mental hindrances, and as such could attain dhyana at will. The one <u>freed by wisdom</u> "may not have reached the 8 liberations ($vimokkha = jh\bar{a}na$) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed" (M 70,16/1:478): see SD 11.1 (5.2) for details; also **Mahā Suñña-ta S** (M 122), SD 11.4 (3.3).

⁶⁸ See (1.1.1.1).